

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

USDC SDNY  
DOCUMENT  
ELECTRONICALLY FILED  
DOC #:  
DATE FILED: 12/20/2024

----- X  
RUBY FREEMAN and WANDREA' MOSS,

Plaintiffs,

-v-

RUDOLPH W. GIULIANI,

Defendant,

-and-

ANDREW H. GIULIANI,

Intervenor-Defendant Applicant.  
-----

X  
RUBY FREEMAN and WANDREA' MOSS,

Plaintiffs,

-v-

RUDOLPH W. GIULIANI,

Defendant.  
-----

24-mc-00353 (LJL)

24-cv-06563 (LJL)

ORDER

LEWIS J. LIMAN, United States District Judge:

Plaintiffs Ruby Freeman and Wandrea' Moss ("Plaintiffs") move to compel third party Ryan Medrano's response to their Rule 45 document subpoena and request that they be permitted to serve Mr. Medrano by the same alternate means previously approved by the Court for Mr. Medrano, i.e., via email to Defendant's counsel, email to Mr. Medrano's known email address, and via FedEx to his home address. *See* 24-mc-353, Dkt. No. 176; 24-cv-6563, Dkt. No. 141. The Court grants in part and denies in part Plaintiffs' request for alternate service. For consistency with the modes of alternate service permitted with respect to Dr. Ryan and Mr. Goodman and for the same reasons stated in the Court's

December 10, 2024, Orders at Dkt. No. 24-mc-353, Dkt. No. 161; 24-cv-6563, Dkt. No. 120, the Court finds that for the pendency of this action, service to Mr. Medrano's email address, in addition to service by certified mail to his home address, is appropriate under C.P.L.R. § 308(5). Mr. Medrano shall be served by these alternate means today, December 20, 2024, with copies of Plaintiffs' motions to compel and this Order. Mr. Medrano shall respond by no later than 12 p.m. on December 26, 2024.

Proof of service shall be filed on the docket.

SO ORDERED.

Dated: December 20, 2024  
New York, New York

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'L. Liman', is written over a horizontal line.

LEWIS J. LIMAN  
United States District Judge